
HIV HEALTH SERVICES PLANNING COUNCIL

2009 PRIORITIZATION AND ALLOCATION SUMMIT



**Andrew Spencer Ceremonial Room – 4th Floor
San Francisco LGBT Center- Charles M. Holmes Campus
1800 Market St
San Francisco, CA 94102
Friday, August 28th, 2009
9:00 AM – 5:00 PM**

Council Members Present: Allgaier, Andrews, Antonetty, Briones, Byers, Chandler, Emerson, Flores, Geltmaker, Guillen, Harris, Heath, Hicks, Hubbard, Hudson, Jewell, Margolis, Matillano, Miller, Molnar, Newell, Pearce, Penagos, Pillatzke, Scherich, Simmons, Siron, Soto, Thomas, Thomas, Young.

Council Members Absent: Agtane, Banks, Cooper (E), Frazier (LoA), Harrison (E), Manley (E), Ramos (LoA)

Others Present: Richard Bargetto (Public), Melanie Bien (SFSU MSW Student), Bill Blum (DPH-HHS), Celinda Cantu (DPH-HHS), Elaine Flores (Marin CM), Dean Goodwin (DPH-HHS), Colin Hegarty (Tenderloin Health), Bill Hirsch (ALRP), Michale Milburn Jones (San Mateo Executive Board), Edmund Larry (ASA), Megan O'Day (ACRC), Tim Patriarca (Maitri), David Powell (Westside Community Services), Chad Upshaw (Westside Community Services)

Support Staff Present: Enrique Asis, Natalie Bryson, T.J. Lee

Proxy Votes: Laura Thomas for Jerrold Thomas, Mary Lawrence Hicks for Veronica Pillatzke, Randy Allgaier for Steve Manley.

Minutes

I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 9:12 am by Co-Chair Molnar.

II. Roll Call

Roll was called and quorum was established.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda

The agenda was reviewed and approved by consensus.

IV. Review and Approval of *August 24, 2009* Minutes

The August 24th, 2009 minutes were reviewed and approved by consensus.

V. General Announcements

- Council Support provided two quick updates regarding electronics and voting procedures.
- CM Allgaier clarified exactly how the Needs Assessments are planned and carried out, and how the final information is used by the Planning Council.
- Co-Chair Molnar announced that Greg Zhovreboff tendered his resignation as Planning Council Director and CM Allgaier has agreed to step-in as interim director beginning on September 21st.

VI. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

VII. Introductions and Icebreaker

The Council Co-Chairs introduced facilitator Susan Strong. There was an overview of activities of the meeting, ground rules and logistics were laid out, and there was a review of the Prioritization and Allocation process.

There was no Public Comment on this item.

VIII. Conflict of Interest Disclosure

Each individual declared their conflict of interest or lack thereof.

There was no Public Comment on this item.

IX. Goals of the Summit

CM Allgaier provided a review of the legislative mandate.

There was no Public Comment on this item.

X. Summary Sheets and Utilization Data

The Council was provided with an overview of Service Summary Sheets and Utilization Data by Bill Blum of DPH-HHS.

Public Comment:

David Powel from Westside Community Services spoke about formerly State funded AIDS Case Management.

Edmund Larry from ASA spoke about substance abuse money being used for mental health. He also spoke in favor of Proposition 63.

XI. Break

XII. Integrating Data into Decision Making

Co-Chair Thomas provided the Council with an overview of major data information that has been presented during the Ryan White year. This includes information from the Needs Assessment, Epidemiological information, Reggie/ARIES Data, Summary Sheets, etc. Council Members discussed data trends and how this will apply to their decision making process.

Things to consider at next meeting: The Council would like to work on increasing awareness and advocacy surrounding the Planning Council and the issues they work for. The Membership Committee will take ownership of this.

Public Comment:

Edmund Larry stated that he wants everyone to work together on this, but that there should be places specifically for African Americans to go for services where they can be comfortable.

XIII. Lunch

The Council broke for lunch at 12:05 and returned at 12:50.

XIV. Marin and San Mateo Counties Funding Allocation – VOTE

The Council voted on the allocation decisions from Marin and San Mateo Counties.

Vote by Roll Call on Marin’s allocation decision passed with one abstention. See voting worksheet [1].

Vote by Roll Call on San Mateo’s allocation decision passed with one abstention. See voting worksheet [2].

There was no Public Comment on this item.

XV. Recommendations for Ryan White Priority Setting – VOTE

The Council considered and voted on recommendations for the Prioritization of Ryan White Service Categories.

Original Motion: To keep the current priority order for CARE funded services for the next fiscal year.

Alternate Motion-Co-Chair Molnar/CM Miller: To move Early Intervention Services (46) to number 9 and Home and Community-based Health Services-AIDS Case Management Programs (47) to number 10. **Motion was withdrawn.**

Alternate Motion 2-Co-Chair Molnar/CM Penagos: For Early intervention services (TMP vouchers) which is currently at number 25 be moved to priority number 1 and for AIDS case management to become priority 9.

Public Comment:

Edmund Larry spoke on Case Management wanting to ensure that case management is available 24/7

Vote by Roll Call on the Alternate Motion 2 passed with one abstention. See voting worksheet [3]. Because of this, the original motion was not voted on.

Original Motion: To change the general fund priority order to be the same as the CARE funded priority order.

Vote by roll call on the original motion passed with one abstention. See voting worksheet [4].

XVI. Minority AIDS Initiative Funding – VOTE

The Council voted on recommendations for MAI funding.

MOTION-Co-Chair Thomas/Co-Chair Molnar: To continue to use MAI dollars to fund Centers of Excellence and to use any increase in dollars to fund the Therapeutic Monitoring Program.

CM Siron called the question with no objection.

Public Comment:

Edmund Larry noted that he believes that everyone should be able to get services no matter what.

Vote by roll call on the original motion passed with one recusal. See voting worksheet [5].

XVII. Break 2

XVIII. Recommendations for Ryan White Allocation – VOTE

Council Members considered and voted on recommendations for Ryan White funds allocation. Bill Blum and Dean Goodwin from DPH-HHS provided the Council Members with information to help them make their decisions.

A. Original Motion: In the case of flat funding, current allocations would be reduced proportionally to fund the programs of Dental, Therapeutic Monitoring and Early Intervention, which have been affected by the State budget cuts.

Public Comment:

Bill Hirsch from ALRP thanked Dean Goodwin for all of his hard work manipulating numbers and creating documents that are easy to read. He also noted that he would support any motion that does not cut services.

David Powel from Westside Community Services noted that the flat funding allocation does not address AIDS Case Management and RALF, which took big hits from State reductions and RALF.

Tim Patriarca from Maitri said that he appreciates the backfill, but the Council still needs to make sure that for the next 8 months things are still funded.

Vote by roll call on original motion. The motion passed with one recusal. See voting worksheet [6].

B. Original Motion: In the event of an increase in funding, funding would be allocated proportionally to the following service categories according to their FY'09 levels:

- 1) Therapeutic Monitoring Program
- 2) Dental Services
- 3) Early Intervention Program
- 4) AIDS Case Management

C. Motion Amendment-CM Byers/CM Siron: To accept this proposal with the added language that any additional dollars above what is needed for the above categories be used with the intent of dealing with the elimination of the RALF program and its impact in San Francisco.

Public Comment:

Bill Hirsch spoke in favor of the motion, as he would love to see these important services fully funded.

Edmund Larry spoke in favor of the motion as he feels that case management is extremely important.

Vote by Roll Call on the Motion Amendment (C) passed with three recusals. See voting worksheet [7].

D. Original Motion: In the event of an increase over the amount needed for motion C, any amount over that would be allocated proportionally among all service categories.

George Simmons called the question with no objections.

Public Comment:

Bill Hirsch spoke in favor of the motion, as he would love to maintain the current level of services.

Edmund Larry thinks that extra money should go to mental health and transportation as he feels those are extremely important services...

Vote by Roll Call on the Original Motion passed with two nos. See voting worksheet [8].

E. Original Motion: In the event of a decrease in funding, the cut would be shared proportionally across all service categories.

F. Alternate Motion Co-Chair Molnar/CM Allgaier: In the event of a decrease in funding, fund dental services, the therapeutic monitoring program and the early intervention program. The cut would then be shared proportionally across all service categories.

Public Comment:

Edmund Larry stated that he feels that AIDS Case Management is truly the most important service.

Vote by Roll Call on Alternate Motion (F) passed with three nos. See voting worksheet [9].

XIX. 75/25 Waiver Discussion – VOTE

Council Members considered and voted on the use of the 75/25 waiver.

MOTION-Co-Chair Thomas/CM Miller: That the Council will not need to apply for the 75/25 waiver this year.

There was no Public Comment on this item.

Vote by Roll Call passed unanimously. See voting worksheet [10].

XX. Nominations for Council Co-Chair

Nominations were opened for two Co-Chair positions: the Female Co-Chair and the Person of Color Co-Chair.

CM Siron re-nominated both Co-Chair Thomas and Co-Chair Molnar, seconded by CM Byers. Elections will happen at the next Full Council meeting.

There was no Public Comment on this item.

XXI. Next Meeting Date and Agenda Items

There is a tentative follow-up Summit meeting scheduled for Monday, August 28th, 2009, from 4:30-7:30 pm at the Bayanihan Community Center, 1010 Mission Street, San Francisco, CA 94103.

On October 8th, the HHSPC will have a joint meeting with the HPPC from 4:30-6 and from 6-7:30 the Council will conduct their own business. The Council deliberated on whether to cancel the September or October Full Council meeting.

The Council decided to cancel the September 28th meeting.

XXII. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 4:40 pm by Co-Chair Molnar.

**PRIORITIZATION AND ALLOCATION SUMMIT
HIV Health Services Planning Council**

Roll Call: **P**=Present; **A**=Absent; **E**=Excused; **L**=Leave of Absence

Votes]: **Y**=Yes; **N**=No; **B**=Abstain; **R**= Recused (deduct from quorum)

	August 28, 2009	roll	[1]	[2]	[3]	[4]	[5]	[6]	[7]	[8]	[9]	[10]
1. Mark Agtane***	A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2. Randy Allgaier	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
3. John Andrews	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
4. Margot Antonetty	P	-	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
5. Raymond Banks	A	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
6. Noah Briones	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
7. Jeff Byers	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8. Aaron Chandler	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
9. Billie Cooper	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
10. Cicily Emerson	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
11. Wade Flores	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Donald Frazier	LOA											
12. Matt Geltmaker	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
13. Jesus Guillen	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
14. Chris Harris	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	-	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

15.	Naim Harrison	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
16.	Anna Heath	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	August 28, 2009	roll	[1]	[2]	[3]	[4]	[5]	[6]	[7]	[8]	[9]	[10]
17.	Mary Lawrence Hicks	P	-	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
18.	Cherrlynn Hubbard	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	R	Y	Y	Y
19.	Carol Hudson	P	B	B	B	B	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
20.	Lee Jewell	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
21.	Steve Manley (<i>Proxy Randy Allgaier</i>)	E	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
22.	Paul Margolis	P	Y	Y	Y	-	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
23.	Rachel Matillano	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
24.	Matthew Miller	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	-	Y	Y	N	Y	Y
25.	Mark Molnar	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
26.	Catherine Newell	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
27.	Ken Pearce	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
28.	Maritza Penagos	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	R	R	R	Y	Y	Y
29.	Veronica Pillatzke (<i>Proxy Mary Lawrence Hicks</i>)	P	-	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
	Gerardo Ramos	LOA										
30.	Stacia Scherich	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	-	-	Y	Y	Y
31.	George Simmons	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	R	Y	Y	Y
32.	Charles Siron	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
33.	Donald Soto	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
34.	Jerrold Thomas (<i>Proxy Laura Thomas</i>)	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
35.	Laura Thomas	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
36.	Terry Young	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

Ayes		28	31	31	30	29	30	28	30	29	32
Nayes		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	3	0
Abstain		1	1	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
Recusal		0	0	0	0	1	1	3	0	0	0
Total		29	32	32	31	30	31	31	32	32	32
***Pending Mayoral Appointment											

QUORUM (Needs to be ½ of Total Members: (36/ 2) +1 = 19 members, of which at least 25% of members present must be living with HIV. As of 8/24/2009, 66% of Council members are HIV positive.